



# ALTEX

### ALTERNATIVES TO ANIMAL EXPERIMENTATION

Thomas Hartung and
Herman Koëter:
Food for thought
... on food safety testing
Vor- und Nachdenkliches
... zur Prüfung von
Nahrungsmitteln

Petra Mayr et al.: Literaturbericht 07/08

Mensch und Mitgeschöpf unter ethischem Aspekt

Kirsten Schmidt:

Würde oder Integrität
– Verlangt die gentechnische Veränderung
von Tieren neue
tierethische Konzepte?

Norbert Walz:

Die metaphysische Dimension der Tierethik

Cecilia Muratori:

Gegen die Pariasmoral. Schopenhauer über die Ethik des Tierversuchs



#### Teutsch zum 90sten:

Petra Mayr (Vorbemerkung): Humanität als Solidarität gegenüber Tieren

Heike Baranzke:

Tierschutz, Erbe der Humanität

Gieri Bolliger:

Gotthard M. Teutschs Archiv für Ethik im Tier-, Natur- und Umweltschutz (AET)

Erich Gräßer:

Albert Schweitzers Ethik – ein ungenutztes Erbe

Beat Sitter-Liver:

Gerechtigkeit für alle Lebewesen

News / Nachrichten Comments / Meinungen Tagungsbericht Imprint





#### Dear reader,

in current times we are alternately confronted with euphoric hopes in but also the concrete possibilities of biomedicine. Despite all prognoses, it is often not possible to foretell what many of the current developments may achieve in the future. But one impact they certainly have is that they show us that old patterns of thought and ethical considerations are falling short and need to be reassessed. One such example from the area of animal experiments is the subject of the main article of biologist and philosopher Kirsten Schmidt entitled "Dignity or integrity - Does the genetic modification of animals require new concepts in animal ethics?" The debate on gene technology represents a gauge of animal ethics in general. Do we really only care about avoiding suffering, and is it enough to care only about suffering? If yes, genetic modifications of animals could even contribute to reducing their suffering; at least that is what some of the leading figures in gene technology suggest, who think they have elegantly solved the questions of animal protection by generating mice that are allegedly insensitive to pain. Or is that simply the culmination of the insufferable functionalisation of animals in gene technology? It seems we must fear it is the latter.

The idea that humans and animals share the same biological origins has recently regained popularity. In his main article "The metaphysical dimension of animal ethics" the philosopher Norbert Walz deduces that animals and humans also share a spiritual quality, a similarity that the philosopher Arthur Schopenhauer also employs to argue against animal experiments. The topicality of Schopenhauer's animal ethics is enunciated by philosopher Cecilia Muratori in her main article "Against pariahmoral. Schopenhauer on the ethics of vivisection."

New and established theories and arguments regarding the treatment of animals can be found in the book reviews of our literature report. The relationship between humans and animals is continuously conquering new discussion platforms. This is good news, as it is a prerequisite for change. Our literature report also contains the book review of a harrowing experience report. The former state veterinary of Lower Saxony, Hermann Focke, documents the daily cruelties that characterise the treatment of animals. We look forward to a time when such books no longer need to be written.

The abyss between the legal stipulations of the law and the reality of animal experiments is still grotesquely wide. The revision of the Swiss animal protection law of the 1st of September 2008 aims to address this transnational problem. At last, the enforcement of the law shall also be improved. Read more about this development in the news section.

The establishment of a new chair for alternative methods in Geneva by the university's medical faculty, the Egon-Naef Foundation and the Doerenkamp-Zbinden foundation represents another cornerstone for the animal protection of the future. Further details are in the news section. The EU has presented a new draft of a directive to protect 12 million experimental animals. The retrospective evaluation of proposals to perform animal experiments shall make the scientific results more transparent. More information can be found in the news section.

Animal experimentation for our food safety is the subject of Thomas Hartung's "Food for thought ..." column in this issue. Together with Herman Köeter he throws the spotlight on this area of animal experiments, which is hardly known to the public and is thus seldom the subject of public debate. Therefore, it offers surprising information, for example, the fact that almost ten percent of all toxicological animal experiments are performed for the safety assessment of herbicides and fungicides. The number of animal experiments performed for the safety of our food is thus almost as high as it used to be for testing industrial chemicals.

Gotthard M. Teutsch, a pioneer animal ethicist and animal protectionist, celebrated his ninetieth birthday on the 13th of December. Already in the times when animal protection had little formal footing, Teutsch was an advocate of a better treatment of animals. We convey our heartfelt congratulations with four essays.

ALTEX must continue to evolve; that is what the board and general assembly of the society ALTEX Edition decided. To enable a better recruitment of subscribers outside the Germanspeaking countries, four issues of ALTEX per year will be published in English, starting in 2009. A fifth issue, which will be published at the end of every year, entitled "ALTEXethik", which will appear in German, will contain main articles dealing with all central aspects of the public discussion on the treatment of animals. A main feature will be the literature report: The book reports, which reflect the zeitgeist of the human-animal relationship, will be complemented by German summaries of all the scientific articles published during the year in the ALTEX issues 1-4. With ALTEXethik you can keep an eye on both the social and scientific developments in the field. As a philosopher, to whom the subject of animal ethics has been a central theme for many years, I am pleased to be assuming the office of editor of ALTE-Xethik. I wish you a good New Year and look forward to continuing to inform you of further developments and a more considerate treatment of animals in the future.

Yours sincerely,

Petra Mayr

Editorial office of ALTEX

U2 ALTEX 25, 4/08



# ALTEX

## www.altex.ch

#### A quarterly journal for new paths in biomedical science

Official organ of the European Society for Alternatives to Animal Testing (EUSAAT)

Bd. 25 (4/2008)

#### Editor:

Society ALTEX Edition, Kuesnacht ZH, Switzerland.

President: Nina Schweigert, Zurich, Switzerland, Vicepresident: Helmut Appl, Vienna, Austria, Society Board: Markus Deutsch, Hinwil, Switzerland; Daniel Favre, Thônex, Switzerland. Thomas Hartung, Konstanz, Germany; Claudia Mertens, Winterthur, Switzerland.

Secretary und Editor in Chief: Franz P. Gruber, Kuesnacht ZH, Switzerland.

#### **Editorial Office:**

Franz P. Gruber, Kuesnacht ZH, Switzerland, Petra Mayr, Bad Münder, Germany, Carolin Rauter, Konstanz, Germany, Horst Spielmann, Berlin, Germany. Lectorate: Sonja von Aulock, Konstanz, Germany; Irène Hagmann, Zurich, Switzerland. Webmaster: Goran Krummenacher, Zurich, Switzerland.

#### Address:

Society ALTEX Edition c/o Franz P. Gruber, Weinmanngasse 86, 8700 Kuesnacht ZH, Switzerland Tel.: +41 44 3800830 Fax: +41 44 3800832 e-mail: editor@altex.ch

#### **Advisory Board:**

Bas J. Blaauboer (Utrecht, The Netherlands), Miroslav Cervinka (Hradec Cralove, Czech Republic) Nicole Clemann (Basel, Switzerland) Klaus Cußler (Langen, Germany) Andrzej Elzanowski (Wroclaw, Poland) Friedrich Harrer (Salzburg, Austria) Thomas Hartung (Konstanz, Germany) Jan G. Hengstler (Dortmund, Germany) Jane Huggins (Plainsboro, USA) Marcel Leist (Konstanz, Germany) Coenraad F. M. Hendriksen (Bilthoven, The Netherlands) Claudia Mertens (Winterthur, Switzerland) Brigitte Rusche (Neubiberg, Germany) Walter Pfaller (Innsbruck, Austria) Stefanie Schindler (Konstanz, Germany) Harald Schöffl (Linz, Austria) Horst Spielmann (Berlin, Germany) Gotthard M. Teutsch (Bayreuth, Germany) Jan van der Valk (Utrecht, The Netherlands) Angelo Vedani (Basel, Switzerland)

#### **ALTEX Online:** www.altex.ch

English summaries: http://altweb.jhsph.edu ALTEX is indexed in MEDLINE, Current Contents®, SciSearch® and ISI Document Solution® and EMBASE.

#### Cover picture:

Giotto di Bondone (1266-1337): St. Francis of Assisi preaching to the birds, Chiesa S. Francesco superiore, Florence, Italy.

#### ALTEX is published with the support of the society members and additional sponsors:

Aerztinnen und Aerzte für Tierschutz in

#### Members:

der Medizin, www.aerztefuertierschutz.ch\* Animalfree Research (former FFVFF), www.animalfree-research.org\* Deutscher Tierschutzbund, www.tierschutzbund.de\* Doerenkamp-Zbinden Stiftung, www.doerenkamp-zbinden.org3 Erna-Graff-Stiftung für Tierschutz, www.erna-graff-stiftung.de Fondation Egon Naef, www.fondation-naef.com\* I-CARE, www.icare-worldwide.org Ligue Suisse contre la vivisection, www.lscv.ch\* Ligue Vaudoise pour la défense des animaux et contre la vivisection, www.miaou.ch MEGAT - Mitteleurop. Gesellschaft für Alternativen zu Tierversuchen, www.zet.or.at/MEGAT/\* Menschen für Tierechte - Tierversuchsgegner Baden Württemberg e.V., www.tierrechte-bw.org Stiftung Biografik Labor 3R, www.biograf.ch\* Stiftung für das Tier im Recht, www.tierimrecht.org Tierschutzbund Zürich. www.tierschutzbund-zuerich.ch\* Vier Pfoten Oesterreich, www.vier-pfoten.at zet, Zentrum für Ersatz- und Ergänzungsmethoden zu Tierversuchen, www.zet.or.at3 Zürcher Tierschutz, www.zuerchertierschutz.ch\* \* These members also are sponsors

#### **Additional Sponsors:**

set, Stiftung zur Förderung der Erforschung von Ersatz- und Ergänzungsmethoden zur Einschränkung von Tierversuchen, www.stiftung-set.de

Layout: H. P. Hoesli, Zurich, Switzerland Print: Stuertz GmbH, Wuerzburg, Germany

#### Distribution:

ALTEX, Schuetzenstr. 14, 78462 Konstanz, Postbox 100125, 78401 Konstanz, Germany, Phone: +49-7531-16614, Mobile: +49-1726272224, Fax +49-7531-25833, e-mail: abo@altex.ch

#### **Publisher:**

Spektrum Akademischer Verlag GmbH. Spektrum Akademischer Verlag ist ein Unternehmen von Springer Science+Business Media.

Edition: 800

**Circulation:** 4 times per annum plus supplements

#### **Subscription rates** (starting from 2009):

Full Subscription (four English issues plus ALTEX<sup>ethik</sup>):

Normal: 90 €

Library: 170 € (companies, institutes, libraries) Student: 52 € (please fax proof of student status) Animal Protection: 52 € (members of animal protection organisations)

E-Subscription (only the four English issues):

Normal: 80 €

Library: 160 € (companies, institutes, libraries) Student: 42 € (please fax proof of student status) Animal Protection: 42 € (members of animal protection organisations) NEW: ALTEX ethik subscription ALTEXethik: 15 € (only the German issue ALTEX ethik)

All prices include P&P for all European countries. Additional costs for shipment outside of Europe: 20 € for 4 issues, 25 € for 5 issues.

#### Aims and scope

ALTEX, edited by the Swiss Society ALTEX Edition is the official journal of EUSAAT, the European Society for Alternatives to Animal Testing. ALTEX is devoted to the publication of research on the development and promotion of alternatives to animal experiments according to the 3R concept of Russell and Burch: Replace, Reduce, and Refine. ALTEX is publishing original articles, short communications, reviews as well as news and comments, meeting reports and book reviews in English and German. Animal experiments are defined by the editors as all experimental procedures using animals which may cause pain, suffering, and emotional harm to animals and which are conducted in testing, research and education or to obtain tissues, organs, and other animal derived products.

Besides covering the biomedical aspects of animal experimentation, ALTEX is also devoted to the bioethics of the complex relationship between man and animals. Articles published in ALTEX should express a basic concern about the dignity of living creatures. ALTEX is not only aimed at developing a new approach to recognise animals as partners but it also intends to introduce a scientific sight in the discussions on animal experiments. Articles devoted to the social and ethical aspects of this topic will, therefore, be judged according to stringent scientific standards. Manuscripts submitted to ALTEX are evaluated by two reviewers. The evaluation takes into account the scientific merit of a manuscript and the contribution to animal welfare and the 3R-principle.

© Copyright: Society ALTEX Edition, Kuesnacht ZH, Switzerland

The world is not a factory and animals are not products for our use (...)
Not mercy, but justice is what we owe to the animals

Die Welt ist kein Machwerk und die Tiere sind kein Fabrikat zu unserem Gebrauch (...) Nicht Erbarmen, sondern Gerechtigkeit ist man den Tieren schuldig

> Arthur Schopenhauer (\* 22. Februar 1788 in Danzig; † 21. September 1860 in Frankfurt/Main)